

## TEAM EVALUATION

EVENT: \_\_\_\_\_ ROUND: \_\_\_ ROOM: \_\_\_

AFFIRMATIVE: \_\_\_\_\_ NEGATIVE: \_\_\_\_\_

RESOLUTION: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_.

**CRITERIA FOR JUDGING:** Good debating involves, more than anything else, a clash of issues. While oratorical skill is important, a team must establish its position with evidence and argumentation and refute that of its opposition in like manner in order to fulfill the criteria for good debating.

Please use the questions below to determine which team did the better debating. The list of Debate Judging Criteria serves as a basis for Individual Evaluation and ought not to be used to determine team evaluation unless neither team meets the obligations set out in the first four questions below.

1. **AFFIRMATIVE CASE:** The evidence and argumentation of the affirmative\* team (especially in its first speech) must be believable at first sight. If such a *prima facie* case is not presented, the negative\* team must win. Was the affirmative\* case believable?  
Yes: \_\_\_ No: \_\_\_
  
2. **NEGATIVE RESPONSE:** The negative team is obliged to clash directly and specifically with affirmative\* contentions. Speeches prepared in advance which do not clash do NOT constitute acceptable debate. If the negative team does not clash with a *prima facie* affirmative case, the affirmative team should receive your verdict. Did the negative team clash?  
Yes: \_\_\_ No: \_\_\_
  
3. **AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE:** The affirmative team must specifically respond to any valid challenges to its case raised by the negative team. Failure of the affirmative to do so will result in a negative victory. Did the affirmative\* team respond to all valid challenges?  
Yes: \_\_\_ No: \_\_\_
  
4. **IF BOTH TEAMS MEET THE ABOVE OBLIGATIONS:** Your decision should be awarded to the team which has best established its contentions with evidence and logic and has refuted those of the other team (that is, the team which has better handled the issues of debate). The team that had the best:  
Evidence: \_\_\_\_\_  
Logic: \_\_\_\_\_  
Refutation: \_\_\_\_\_
  
5. **IF NEITHER TEAM MEETS ITS OBLIGATIONS:** The debate must be awarded to the team whose members have demonstrated better the basic skills of debate. The Debate Judging Criteria list may be referred to in this situation. The team with the better basic skills of debate was:  
Aff: \_\_\_ Neg: \_\_\_

**JUDGE'S DECISION:** Using the above criteria, I consider that the best debating was done by the Affirmative / Negative team. (Please circle the winning side. If there is a tie, you should award your decision to the Negative\*.)

\* Unless there is a Counter-Plan, in which case the burden of proof is reversed.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Judge's Signature: \_\_\_\_\_